# *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*

*The International Journal for Healthcare Ethics and Ethics Committees*

**Volume 14, 2005** **Author Index and Contents**

Cambridge University Press

# CQ

## Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

*The International Journal for Healthcare Ethics and Ethics Committees*



EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992-2002

THE DAVID C. THOMASMA INTERNATIONAL BIOETHICS RETREAT

Doris Thomasma, *Coordinator*

COLUMN EDITORS

Bette Anton, *CQ Sources*
Courtney S. Campbell, *Biotechnology and Bioethics*
Kenneth V. Iserson, *Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature*
Andrew Jameton, *Global Bioethics*
Greg S. Loeben, *CQ Review*
Charles MacKay, *Genethics*
Glenn McGee, *Breaking Bioethics*
Robert Schwartz and Ben Rich, *The Caduceus in Court*
Doris Schroeder, *Health and Human Rights*
Tuija Takala and Matti Hayry, *Dissecting Bioethics*
Griffin Trotter, *Bioethics and Defense*

EDITORIAL BOARD

Chair: Tuija Takala, *Department of Moral and Social Philosophy, University of Helsinki, Finland*

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*
William Andereck, *California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Kenneth M. Boyd, *Edinburgh University, Scotland*
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*
Arthur Caplan, *University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia*
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*
Veronique Fournier, *Center for Clinical Ethics, Cochin Hospital, Paris, France*
Amnon Goldworth, *Stanford University School of Medicine*
Chris Hackler, *Division of Medical Humanities, University of Arkansas Medical School*
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*
Matti Hayry, *School of Law, University of Manchester*
Paul Hofmann, *Provenance Health Partners, Moraga, California*
Albert Jonsen, *Department of Medical History and Ethics, University of Washington*
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Helga Kuhse, *Centre for Human Bioethics, Monash University, Australia*
Glenn McGee, *Center for Medical Ethics, The Albany Medical College, New York*
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Biomedical Ethics, University of Virginia*
Edmund D. Pellegrino, *Georgetown Center for the Advanced Study of Ethics, Georgetown University*
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*
Gerd Richter, *Philipps University, Marburg, Germany*
Lawrence J. Schneiderman, *University of California, San Diego*
Richard Selzer, *Yale University*
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*
Evert van Leeuwen, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Baroness Mary Warnock, *Girton College, Cambridge University, England*



EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to TKushner@aol.com.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211/Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 14 (2005): Institutional rate, print and online: $189 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; £116 elsewhere. Institutional rate, online only: $158 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; £97 elsewhere. Institutional rate, print only: $170 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; £102 elsewhere. Individual rate, print only: $75 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; £47 elsewhere. Single part: $46 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; £28 elsewhere. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at http://journals.cambridge.org.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK.



**Copyright © 2005 Cambridge University Press.** *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Photocopying information for users in the USA: The Item-Fee Code for this publication indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Section 107 or 108 of the US Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transactional Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of $16.00 per article is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained from the publisher for all other copying. The Item-Fee Code for this journal is 0963-1801/05 $16.00.

ISI Tearsheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Article reprints are available from the authors. For orders of 50 or more reprints, contact Cambridge University Press.

# *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*

## 2005 Author Index


Akabayashi, Akira, 277
Anton, Bette, 189, 298, 432
Árnason, Vilhjálmur, 322

Brody, Howard, 141
Browne, Alister, 287

Callahan, Daniel, 424
Churchill, Larry R., 389

Davis, Walt, 57
Denier, Yvonne, 224
Dudzinski, Denise M., 464

Eckenwiler, Lisa, 306
Elger, Bernice S., 329
Elliott, Carl, 379

Fins, Joseph J., 207, 434
Fournier, Veronique, 281
Fox, Renée C., 361

Garchar, Kimberly, 147
Gillon, Raanan, 100
Giordano, Simona, 83
Glannon, Walter, 191
Goldworth, Amnon, 346
Gross, Michael L., 444
Gundle, Kenneth, 113

Hall, Mark A., 156
Halldenius, Lena, 455
Harris, John, 93
Hawkins, Anne Hunsaker, 40
Häyry, Matti, 7, 199
Heilig, Steve, 214
Hellsten, Sirkku K., 256
Herissone-Kelly, Peter, 268

Iserson, Kenneth V., 125, 240, 352, 468

Jafarey, Aamir M., 249

Keenan, James F., 416
Kimsma, Gerrit K., 292

Ladikas, Miltos, 404

McConnell, Terrance, 47
Mills, Ann E., 57
Moazam, Farhat, 249

Nagy, John D., 119
Nativio, Donna G., 47

Rhodes, Rosamond, 13
Rich, Ben A., 27
Ross, Lainie Friedman, 191

Schenck, David, 389
Schneiderman, Lawrence J., 235
Schroeder, Doris, 218, 221, 404
Scott, Rosamund, 65
Sevick, Mary Ann, 47
Slingsby, Brian Taylor, 277
Spital, Aaron, 107, 195
Steinberg, David, 301
Sullivan, Bill, 287
Swazey, Judith P., 361

Takala, Tuija, 385
Takimoto, Yoshiyuki, 277
Tereskerz, Patricia, 57
Trotter, Griffin, 131, 316
Turner, Leigh, 374

van Leeuwen, Evert, 292

Waller, Bruce N., 177
Wildes, Kevin Wm., 168

Young, Judith Schaeffer, 432

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*

Volume 14, Number 1, Winter 2005

CONTENTS

Contributors 1

***Special Section: Open Forum***

From the Editors 3

A Defense of Ethical Relativism
MATTI HÄYRY 7

Justice in Medicine and Public Health
ROSAMOND RHODES 13

Medical Custom and Medical Ethics: Rethinking the Standard of Care
BEN A. RICH 27

Epiphanic Knowledge and Medicine
ANNE HUNSAKER HAWKINS 40

Genetic Testing of Children for Late Onset Disease
MARY ANN SEVICK, DONNA G. NATIVIO, AND TERRANCE MCCONNELL 47

Is Evaluating Ethics Consultation on the Basis of Cost a Good Idea?
ANN E. MILLS, PATRICIA TERESKERZ, AND WALT DAVIS 57

Prenatal Testing, Reproductive Autonomy, and Disability Interests
ROSAMUND SCOTT 65

Respect for Equality and the Treatment of the Elderly: Declarations of Human Rights and Age-Based Rationing
SIMONA GIORDANO 83

The Age-Indifference Principle and Equality
JOHN HARRIS 93

***Departments and Columns***

*Dissecting Bioethics*
TUIJA TAKALA AND MATTI HÄYRY
Toleration and Healthcare Ethics
RAANAN GILLON 100

*Perspectives*
Conscription of Cadaveric Organs for Transplantation: A Stimulating Idea Whose Time Has Not Yet Come
AARON SPITAL 107

Presumed Consent: An International Comparison and Possibilities for Change in the United States
KENNETH GUNDLE 113

*CQ Review*
GREG LOEBEN
*Dicing with Death: Chance, Risk and Health*, by Stephen Senn
Reviewed by JOHN D. NAGY 119

*Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature*
KENNETH V. ISERSON 125

*Contents continued*

Volume 14, Number 2, Spring 2005

CONTENTS

Contributors 129

***Special Section: Patient Ethics***

Guest Editorial: Of Lotteries Lost and Partnerships Forged: The Perils and Promises of Patient Ethics
GRIFFIN TROTTER 131

Patient Ethics and Evidence-Based Medicine—The Good Healthcare Citizen
HOWARD BRODY 141

The Loyal Patient at the End of Life: A Roycean Argument for Assisted Suicide
KIMBERLY GARCHAR 147

The Importance of Trust for Ethics, Law, and Public Policy
MARK A. HALL 156

Patients: The Rosetta Stone in the Crisis of Medicine
KEVIN WM. WILDES 168

Responsibility and Health
BRUCE N. WALLER 177

*CQ Sources/Bibliography*
BETTE ANTON 189

***Departments and Columns***

*Responses and Dialogue*
Response to "Intrafamilial Organ Donation Is Often an Altruistic Act" by Aaron Spital (CQ Vol 12, No 1) and "Donor Benefit Is the Key to Justified Living Organ Donation," by Aaron Spital (CQ Vol 13, No 1)
Motivation, Risk, and Benefit in Living Organ Donation: A Reply to Aaron Spital
WALTER GLANNON AND LAINIE FRIEDMAN ROSS 191

Reply to Glannon and Ross
AARON SPITAL 195

*Dissecting Bioethics*
TUIJA TAKALA AND MATTI HÄYRY
Precaution and Solidarity
MATTI HÄYRY 199

*Changing Places*
Everyday Disasters
JOSEPH J. FINS 207

*CQ Interview*
Stem Cell Science and Politics: A Talk with Elizabeth Blackburn
STEVE HEILIG 214

*Health and Human Rights*
Editorial
DORIS SCHROEDER 218

*Contents continued*

Human Rights and Their Role in Global Bioethics
DORIS SCHROEDER 221

On Personal Responsibility and the Human Right to Healthcare
YVONNE DENIER 224

*Perspectives*
The Perils of Hope
LAWRENCE J. SCHNEIDERMAN 235

*Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature*
KENNETH V. ISERSON 240

Volume 14, Number 3, Summer 2005

CONTENTS

Contributors 243

***Special Section: International Voices***

From the Editors 246

Pakistan and Biomedical Ethics: Report from a Muslim Country
FARHAT MOAZAM AND AAMIR M. JAFAREY 249

Bioethics in Tanzania: Legal and Ethical Concerns in Medical Care and Research in Relation to the HIV/AIDS Epidemic
SIRKKU K. HELLSTEN 256

The Cloning Debate in the United Kingdom: The Academy Meets the Public
PETER HERISSONE-KELLY 268

Conflict of Interest: A Japanese Perspective
AKIRA AKABAYASHI, BRIAN TAYLOR SLINGSBY, AND YOSHIYUKI TAKIMOTO 277

The Balance between Beneficence and Respect for Patient Autonomy in Clinical Medical Ethics in France
VERONIQUE FOURNIER 281

Abortion in Canada
ALISTER BROWNE AND BILL SULLIVAN 287

Shifts in the Direction of Dutch Bioethics: Forward or Backward?
GERRIT K. KIMSMA AND EVERT VAN LEEUWEN 292

*CQ Sources/Bibliography*
BETTE ANTON 298

***Departments and Columns***

*Responses and Dialogue*
Response to "Special Section: Children as Organ Donors" (*CQ* Vol 13, No 2)
A Critique
DAVID STEINBERG 301

*Bioethics and Defense*
Ethics and the Underpinnings of Policy in Biodefense and Emergency Preparedness
LISA ECKENWILER 306

*Contents continued*

What Jurisdiction? Whose Justice? A Response to Eckenwiler
GRIFFIN TROTTER 316

*Dissecting Bioethics*
TUIJA TAKALA AND MATTI HÄYRY
Sensible Discussion in Bioethics: Reflections on Interdisciplinary Research
VILHJÁLMUR ÁRNASON 322

*Ethics of Human Research*
CHARLES MACKAY
Attitudes of Future Lawyers and Psychologists to the Use of Genetic Testing for Criminal Behavior
BERNICE S. ELGER 329

*Perspectives*
Disease, Illness, and Medical Ethics
AMNON GOLDWORTH 346

*Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature*
KENNETH V. ISERSON 352

Volume 14, Number 4, Fall 2005

CONTENTS

Contributors 355

***Special Section: Quo Vadis? Mapping the Future of Bioethics***

From the Editors 357

Examining American Bioethics: Its Problems and Prospects
RENÉE C. FOX AND JUDITH P. SWAZEY 361

Bioethics, Social Class, and the Sociological Imagination
LEIGH TURNER 374

The Soul of a New Machine: Bioethicists in the Bureaucracy
CARL ELLIOTT 379

Demagogues, Firefighters, and Window Dressers: Who Are We and What Should We Be?
TUIJA TAKALA 385

One Cheer for Bioethics: Engaging the Moral Experiences of Patients and Practitioners Beyond the Big Decisions
LARRY R. CHURCHILL AND DAVID SCHENCK 389

Too Early for Global Ethics?
MILTOS LADIKAS AND DORIS SCHROEDER 404

Developments in Bioethics from the Perspective of HIV/AIDS
JAMES F. KEENAN 416

Bioethics and the Culture Wars
DANIEL CALLAHAN 424

*Contents continued*

*CQ Sources/Bibliography*
BETTE ANTON AND JUDITH SCHAEFFER YOUNG 432

***Departments and Columns***

*The 2005 David Thomasma Lecture*
Baseball and Bioethics
JOSEPH J. FINS 434

*Bioethics and Defense*
GRIFFIN TROTTER
Physician-Assisted Draft Evasion: Civil Disobedience, Medicine, and War
MICHAEL L. GROSS 444

*Dissecting Bioethics*
TUIJA TAKALA AND MATTI HÄYRY
Dissecting "Discrimination"
LENA HALLDENIUS 455

*CQ Review*
GREG LOEBEN
*Organizational Ethics in Health Care: Principles, Cases, and Practical Solutions,* by Philip J. Boyle, Edwin R. DuBose, Stephen J. Ellingson, David E. Guinn, and David B. McCurdy
Reviewed by DENISE M. DUDZINSKI 464

*Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature*
KENNETH V. ISERSON 468

Author Index and Contents for Volume 14 I